THE ROLE OF CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN MENTORING

JUNE 26, 2020
AUCD NATIONAL TRAINING DIRECTORS COUNCIL WEBINAR

DEBRA C. VIGIL, PHD
ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR AT THE UNIVERSITY OF NEVADA RENO IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SPEECH PATHOLOGY & AUDIOLOGY,
DIRECTOR OF THE UNIVERSITY CENTER FOR AUTISM AND NEURODEVELOPMENT (UCAN),
CO-DIRECTOR OF THE NVLEND PROGRAM,
CHAIR OF THE NVLTSAE STATE TEAM

JANICE ENRIQUEZ, PHD
UC DAVIS MIND INSTITUTE/ DIVISION OF DEVELOPMENTAL AND BEHAVIORAL PEDIATRICS
ASSOCIATE CLINICAL PROFESSOR, LEND TRAINING DIRECTOR, UCEEDD MCC REPRESENTATIVE
AUCD MCC SECRETARY/CO-DIRECTOR MCHC RISE-UP
LEARNING OBJECTIVES

• IDENTIFY THEORETICAL CONCEPTS OF MENTORING UNDERREPRESENTED INDIVIDUALS THAT CAN BE APPLIED TO LEND TRAINEES

• DISCUSS BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES IN DEVELOPING CROSS-DIFFERENCE MENTORING RELATIONSHIPS.

• APPLY PRACTICAL IDEAS TO GUIDE FACULTY IN MENTORING LEND TRAINEES FROM UNDERREPRESENTED BACKGROUNDS
### COMPARISON OF IDENTITY FORMATION MODELS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Erikson’s Stages of Psychosocial Development</th>
<th>White Racial Identity Model (Helms)</th>
<th>People of Color Identity Model (Cross)</th>
<th>Biracial Identity Model (Posten)</th>
<th>Social &amp; Psychosocial Disability Identity Development (Forber-Pratt)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Trust vs mistrust</td>
<td>• Contact status</td>
<td>• Pre-encounter status</td>
<td>• Personal identity</td>
<td>• Acceptance status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Autonomy vs shame and doubt</td>
<td>• Disintegration status</td>
<td>• Encounter status</td>
<td>• Choice of group categorization (monoracial identity)</td>
<td>o Become or born with disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Initiative vs guilt</td>
<td>• Pseudo-independence status</td>
<td>• Immersion/emersion status</td>
<td>• Appreciation of multiple identity and exploration of heritages</td>
<td>o Acceptance of disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Industry vs inferiority</td>
<td>• Immersion/emersion status</td>
<td>• Internalization/commitment</td>
<td>• Integration and valuing of multicultural identity</td>
<td>o Friends/family accept disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identity vs role confusion</td>
<td>• Autonomy status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Relationship status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Intimacy vs isolation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Meets others similar to self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Generativity vs stagnation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Engages in conversation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ego integrity vs despair</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Learns ways of group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Adoption status: Adopts shared group values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Engagement status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Becomes role model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Helps others to develop status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Give back to community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Acceptance status</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CULTURAL COMPETENCE

“a set of congruent behaviors, attitudes and policies that come together in a system, agency or those professionals to work effectively in cross-cultural situations”

- Adapt to diversity
- Value diversity
- Institutionalized cultural knowledge
- Cultural self-assessment
- Communication fundamentals
MENTORING: SHARED MEANING

MENTOR, MENTEE, RECIPROCAL RELATIONSHIPS
TRAINEE COMPOSITION:
“UNDERREPRESENTED” TRAINEES

NIH/NSF DEFINITION

GRADUATE STUDIES

LEND & UCEEDD
## Percentage of Racial and Ethnic Demographics in Different Healthcare Fields

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Hispanic</th>
<th>Native American</th>
<th>Asian</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary Care Medicine</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>5.96</td>
<td>.7</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Therapy</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Therapy</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speech Pathology &amp; Audiology</td>
<td>90.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LEND

TRAINEES: FY2019-20

White: 73%
Black: 10%
Indian: 1%
Asian Pac Isl: 10%
Multirac/Oth: 6%
Indian: 1%
Black: 10%
White: 73%
TRAIINEES: FY 2019-20

- White: 71%
- Black: 6%
- Indian: 2%
- Asian Pac Isl: 10%
- Multirac /Oth: 11%
- Multirac /Oth: 11%
UCEDD + LEND Trainees with Disability: FY 2019-20

LENDs+UCEDDs Trainees with Disability 7%
Challenges for Mentee

- Social isolation
- Serving on additional committees or activities
- Difficulty negotiating microaggressions
UNDERREPRESENTED MENTEES: EXPERIENCE

• SEE THEMSELVES AS “DIFFERENT” OR “OUTSIDER”

• FEEL THE NEED TO CONSTANTLY PROVE AND REPROVE AND MEET A “HIGH BAR”

• NEED TO BALANCE MULTIPLE SOCIAL AND CULTURAL IDENTITIES DIFFERENT FROM MENTORS

• QUESTIONED ON LEGITIMACY OF BEING IN PROGRAM

• HIGH COGNITIVE LOAD
UNDERREPRESENTED MENTEES: EXPERIENCE

- STRONG DESIRE FOR MENTORS VIEWED “LIKE THEM”
- EXPERIENCE COMMUNICATION DIFFERENCES FROM MENTOR
- EXPERIENCE OF “DOUBLE JEOPARDY”
- IMPOSTER SYNDROME, STEREOTYPE THREAT, ISOLATION, MENTAL HEALTH CONCERNS AND DECREASED PRODUCTIVITY
CREATING A DIVERSE AND INCLUSIVE AND SUPPORTIVE COMMUNITY ENHANCES RESEARCH PRODUCTIVITY, TEACHING EFFECTIVENESS, FACULTY RECRUITMENT & RETENTION, SATISFACTION, DECREASES ATTRITION, MORE POSITIVE ORGANIZATIONAL CLIMATE
SIGNIFICANCE OF SUPPORTING UR TRAINEES

• “MAY HOLD SIGNIFICANT INSIGHT INTO THE COMPLEX ETIOLOGIES AND SOLUTIONS TO ALLEVIATE HEALTH DISPARITIES”

• “VALUING CULTURAL AND LINGUISTIC DIVERSITY, AS WELL AS CONSIDERING MULTIPLE IDENTITIES AND INTERSECTIONALITY, WITHIN THE MENTORING RELATIONSHIP PROVIDES A FOUNDATION THAT FOSTERS SELF-EFFICACY AND A SUCCESSFUL RESEARCH CAREER FOR SCHOLAR AND FACULTY”

• “ACHIEVING DIVERSITY IN SCIENCE HINGES ON CULTIVATING TALENT AND PROMOTING THE FULL INCLUSION OF EXCELLENCE ACROSS THE ENTIRE POPULATION”

(WYATT & BELCHER, 2019)
DISPARITIES IN MENTORING

• 60 TO 70% OF PSYCHOLOGY GRADUATE STUDENTS REPORT NOT HAVING A MENTOR

• THE NIH BIOMEDICAL RESEARCH WORKFORCE PIPELINE REPORT 1 NOTED THAT ‘MENTORSHIP’ WAS AMONG THE TOP THREE MOST FREQUENTLY NOTED PIPELINE ISSUES FOR UR STUDENTS

• FACULTY PERSONAL EXPERIENCES
  • PROFESSIONAL ISOLATION, EXCLUSION FROM NETWORKS, UNINTENDED BIAS FROM COLLEAGUES, SOCIETAL NORMS, CULTURAL TAXATION, BICULTURALISM, DEVALUATION OF SCHOLARSHIP RELEVANT FOR UR GROUPS, LENGTHIER PROMOTION TRAJECTORY & ATTRITION
ROLE OF MENTORS

• EFFECTIVE MENTORING RELATIONSHIPS HAVE BEEN SHOWN TO
  • IMPROVE MOTIVATION AND RETENTION OF STUDENTS, INCREASE SELF-EFFICACY, RESEARCH
    PRODUCTIVITY, PREPARE THEM FOR FUTURE OPPORTUNITIES, OFFER PROFESSIONAL SOCIALIZATION
    AND NETWORKING

• WITHOUT “CONSCIOUSLY HONED SET OF COMMUNICATION SKILLS, MENTOR RELATIONSHIP
  WILL FAIL TO ACHIEVE FULL POTENTIAL TO ENHANCE CAREER OF UR GROUPS”

(OSMAN, 2018)
CHALLENGE IN MENTOR-MENTEE RELATIONSHIP

1. Conversation about race & ethnicity and self-determination
2. Challenges in and outside of relationship
3. Address each other’s biases
4. Career advice
5. Characteristics of ideal mentee?
Mentoring Across Differences

Nora Yusuf Osman, MD, Barbara Gottlieb, MD*

*Corresponding author: bgottlieb@partners.org
BASIC MENTORING VALUES

- Mutual respect
- Honesty
- Confidentiality
- Conflict management
- Transparency
- Recognition

Wyatt et al., 2019
STRATEGIES

Mentor-mentee relationship framework
- Collaborative development of expectations
- Mentors share personal experiences
- Feelings of disempowerment, undervalued, burnout, define personal boundaries
- Open door policy

Discuss race and bias
- Personal issues
- Unconscious bias in White systems
- Model coping strategies

Skill building & support
STRATEGIES: SYSTEMS-LEVEL CHANGE

MENTORS NEED NETWORK OF COLLEAGUES
CULTURALLY CONGRUENT MENTORING: MODELS & THEORIES

IDENTIFY THEORETICAL CONCEPTS OF MENTORING UNDERREPRESENTED INDIVIDUALS THAT CAN BE APPLIED TO LEND TRAINEES
MENTORING PARADIGMS: COMMONALITIES

- MANY MODELS
- PARADIGMS:
  - MENTEE’S ACHIEVEMENT
  - EMOTIONAL/PSYCHOLOGICAL SUPPORT
  - DIRECT ASSISTANCE WITH CAREER AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT, MODELING
  - PERSONAL & RECIPROCAL RELATIONSHIP
  - MENTORS HAVE GREATER EXPERIENCE, INFLUENCE, SUCCESS

(JACOBI, 1991; PFUND, 2016)
MENTORING: THEORIES & MEASURABLE ATTRIBUTES

• ACADEMIC PERSISTENCE & CAREER ATTAINMENT MODEL
• SOCIAL COGNITIVE CAREER THEORY
• SCIENCE IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT & SOCIAL NEGOTIATION
• SOCIAL CAPITAL PERSPECTIVE & CAREER STAGE MENTORING

• CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE/DIVERSITY:
  • ADVANCE EQUITY & INCLUSION
  • BE CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE
  • REDUCE THE IMPACT OF BIAS & STEREOTYPE THREAT

(PFUND, 2016)
Culturally Congruent Mentorship
Wyatt & Belcher (2019)

Figure 1. Mentors’ Wheel: A culturally congruent foundation for mentoring scholars and faculty from underrepresented populations. ©Belcher, Stone, Wyatt, 2019. All rights reserved. See the online article for the color version of this figure.
Mentoring Mentors: Students of Diverse Backgrounds

Wyatt et al (2019)
EFFECTIVE MENTORING OF UNDERREPRESENTED SCHOLARS

Mentorship Process

Initiated based on
- Mutual interest

Built on
- Trust
- Communication
- Active reflection

Fostered through
- Variety of styles and mentoring approaches

(Lanzi et al., 2019)
DEVELOPMENTAL FRAMEWORK: SUPPORTING UR TRAINEES

Stage 1: Launching stage

Stage 2: Active Growth and Learning stage

Stage 3: Independence and maturity

Stage 4: Peerage and Mutual mentoring

(Lanzi et al., 2019)
Table 1. Summary of the Developmental Framework for Mentoring Underrepresented Doctoral Trainees and Early Career Scholars

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage (initiation)</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Time frame</th>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>Strategies for success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Launching          | Mentee and mentor engage, become acquainted, set expectations and working guidelines, build trust, and demonstrate shared commitment | Initial stage of engagement with the doctoral program, mentor, and coursework | 1. Microaggressions  
2. Conscious and unconscious biases and stereotypes  
3. Uncertainty of each other’s behaviors, culture, experiences, and/or values  
4. Inability to identify potential barriers in the mentor/mentee relationship | 1. Engagement:  
a. Either informally or formally  
b. Express mutual interest  
c. Mentor commitment and validation  
2. Setting expectations:  
a. Short- and long-term goals and strategies discussion  
b. Preferred methods of communications  
c. Expected outcomes  
3. Building trust:  
a. Affect-based  
b. Cognitive-based  
4. Mutual appraisal of strengths and individual needs of mentee  
5. Mutuality and bidirectionality of the mentorship relationship  
6. Open-mindedness and nonjudgmental attitude  
7. Effective communication  
8. Empathy and cultural humility |
THEORIES & RECOMMENDATIONS:
CULTURAL HUMILITY & CULTURAL SAFETY

MENTOR:

• DIVERSITY ≠ “ISSUE” TO MANAGE
• CULTURALLY COMPETENT VS.
• CULTURALLY SENSITIVE “CONTINUALLY ENGAGE IN SELF-REFLECTION AND SELF-CRITIQUE
• ACKNOWLEDGES BIAS, PRIVILEGE, CRITICAL SELF-AWARENESS
• CULTURAL SAFETY: TRAINEE CONTRIBUTES, BI-DIRECTIONAL
• MENTEE AS “CULTURAL EXPERT”
• MINDFUL OF INTERSECTIONAL IDENTITIES
• RECOGNIZE ADDITIONAL AND CONSTANT PRESSURE AND THREATS TO TRAINEES
• BALANCE SUPPORT AND AUTONOMY, PRIVACY
• HEP TRAINEE NAVIGATE INSTITUTIONAL DISCRIMINATIONS
• ADDRESS STRUCTURAL AND INTERPERSONAL ASPECTS
THEORIES & RECOMMENDATIONS

• CULTURAL CONGRUENCE:
  • VALUE DIFFERENCES: HIERARCHICAL COLLECTIVISTIC VALUES VS. EGALITARIAN VALUES (CHIN, 2019)

• CONVERSATIONS ABOUT RACE AND ETHNICITY (ALEGRIA, 2019)
  • CREATE SPACE WHERE CONVERSATIONS OF RACE/ETHNICITY/UR STATUS ARE WELCOMED AND ENCOURAGED, CLIMATE AND RELATIONSHIP TO PROGRAM SUCCESS, COST/BENEFIT FOR SERVING ON COMMITTEES/ORGANIZATIONS, MAKING TIME

• CULTURAL HUMILITY: HIV RESEARCH (WALTERS, 2016)
  • IDENTIFY HOW CULTURAL BELIEFS INFLUENCE MENTORING PRACTICES
  • RECOGNIZE HOW CULTURAL DIVERSITY CAN AFFECT (+/-) MENTORING RELATIONSHIPS, ACKNOWLEDGE IMPACT OF CONSCIOUS/UNCONSCIOUS ASSUMPTIONS, PRIVILEGE, STEREOTYPE THREAT, BIASES IMPACT MENTORING RELATIONSHIPS, APPLY STRATEGIES

• LGBTQ+ RECOMMENDATIONS (HOLLOWAY ET A., 2019): SELF-EDUCATE, USE ACTIVE SKILLS AND STRATEGIES, ADVOCATE
Organizational Strategies
- Establish a Climate for Mentoring
- Faculty Diversity
- Rewards for Effective Mentoring

Faculty Strategies
- Faculty Mentoring Competence
- Faculty Multicultural Competence
- Expanded and Diverse Professional Networks

Minority Graduate Student Strategies
- Program/Department Selection
- Student Openness to Diverse Mentoring
- Multiple Mentors
- University Involvement

Figure 1.
Student, faculty, and organizational strategies for enhancing mentoring quality

(Thomas, 2007)
MENTORING UR: TOOLS

APPLY PRACTICAL IDEAS TO GUIDE FACULTY IN MENTORING LEND TRAINEES FROM UNDERREPRESENTED BACKGROUNDS
CULTURALLY AWARE MENTORING (CAM) PROGRAM

• THEORETICALLY DRIVEN: MULTICULTURAL, FEMINIST, CRITICAL RACE, MOTIVATION, INSTITUTIONAL TRANSFORMATION

• MENTOR: GAIN INTRAPERSONAL AND INTERPERSONAL CULTURAL AWARENESS, SKILLS TO RECOGNIZE AND RESPOND TO CULTURAL DIVERSITY ISSUES IN MENTORING

(Byars-Winston, et al., 2018)
MENTORING THE MENTOR

UCSF

- SELF-EFFICACY THEORY
- UNCONSCIOUS BIAS, MICROAGGRESSIONS, COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES, MENTOR CONSULTATION CLINIC

(Johnson & Ghandi, 2015; Ghandi & Johnson, 2016)
“THERE IS A BELIEF THAT DIALOGUES ON RACE ARE PURELY INTELLECTUAL EXERCISES, THEREBY MINIMIZING THE EXPRESSION OF EMOTIONS IN RACE TALK AND LOSING AN OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLORE THEIR MEANINGS...RACE TALK ON THE PART OF PEOPLE OF COLOR IS ABOUT BEARING WITNESS TO THEIR LIVED REALITIES, THEIR PERSONAL AND COLLECTIVE EXPERIENCES...THE ACADEMIC PROTOCOL DISCOURAGES THESE SOURCES OF INFORMATION..”

SUE, 2015
RESOURCES

• GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY, NATIONAL CENTER FOR CULTURAL COMPETENCE: HTTPS://NCCC.GEORGETOWN.EDU/CURRICULA/MODULES.HTML

• BWH MENTORING CURRICULUM & TOOLKIT WEBSITE. HTTP://BWHMENTORINGTOOLKIT.PARTNERS.ORG PUBLISHED 2016

• NATIONAL RESEARCH MENTORING NETWORK: HTTPS://NRMNET.NET/#UNDERGRADPOPUP

• NEURONLINE PROFESSIONAL RESOURCES: HTTPS://NEURONLINE.SFN.ORG/DIVERSITY

• DIVERSITY PROGRAM CONSORTIUM: HTTPS://WWW.DIVERSITYPROGRAMCONSORTIUM.ORG/PAGES/

• CENTER OF IMPROVEMENT FOR MENTORED EXPERIENCES IN RESEARCH, COMPLETE MENTOR CURRICULA: HTTPS://CIMERPROJECT.ORG/#/COMPLETECURRICULA


• AMERICAN PSYCHOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION
  • LGBTQ CLIMATE ASSESSMENT CH. 4 FOR MENTORS: HTTPS://WWW.APA.ORG/APAGS/RESOURCES/CLGBT-CLIMATE-GUIDE.PDF

• PATHWAYS TO SCIENCE: HTTPS://WWW.PATHWAYSTOSCIENCE.ORG/
  • GROWING THE DIVERSITY AWARENESS AND CULTURAL COMPETENCE OF FACULTY AND PARTNERS
REFERENCES


